



I hereby give notice that an ordinary meeting of the Heritage Advisory Panel will be held on:

Date: Tuesday, 20 October 2015
Time: 5.30pm
Meeting Room: Level 2 Reception Lounge
Venue: Town Hall

Heritage Advisory Panel

OPEN AGENDA

MEMBERSHIP

Chairperson	Cr Mike Lee
Deputy Chairperson	Sherry Reynolds
Members	Elizabeth Aitken-Rose
	Graeme Burgess
	John Burns
	Leyton Chan
	Helen Geary
	Sally Hughes
	Allan Matson
	Jane Matthews
	Dr Ann McEwan
	Claudia Page
	Bill Rayner
	David Veart
	Lorraine Wilson

(Quorum 10 members)

Katherine Wilson
Democracy Advisor

13 October 2015

Contact Telephone: (09) 890 8133
Email: katherine.wilson@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Website: www.aucklandcouncil.govt.nz

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Purpose

- Provide advice to the council in relation to:
 - the direction and content of strategies, policies and initiatives
 - any matter that the panel considers to be of particular interest or concern to the historic heritage of Auckland
- To deliver advice for improving the promotion and management of historic heritage of the Auckland region
- Advise Auckland Council on council processes and mechanisms for engagement with the historic heritage community, including owners of heritage buildings in Auckland.
- To recommend historic heritage expert membership and provide advice to the Auckland Urban Design Panel.

Scope

To provide a forum for the consideration of issues affecting historic heritage of the Auckland region and provide advice to the council.

Priorities

The priorities for the panel include:

- Historic Heritage Plan
- Issues relating to the Unitary Plan
- Council processes
- Input into the Auckland Urban Design Panel.

Membership

The panel's spokesperson is its chairperson.

ITEM	TABLE OF CONTENTS	PAGE
1	Apologies	5
2	Declaration of Interest	5
3	Confirmation of Minutes	5
4	Extraordinary Business	5
5	Public Input: St David's Memorial Church, Paul Baragwanath	7
6	Public input: Rob Thomas - presentation on behalf of Save the King's School Hanna Block	9
7	Heritage Managers' update	17
8	Consideration of Extraordinary Items	

1 Apologies

At the close of the agenda no apologies had been received.

2 Declaration of Interest

Members are reminded of the need to be vigilant to stand aside from decision making when a conflict arises between their role as a member and any private or other external interest they might have.

3 Confirmation of Minutes

That the Heritage Advisory Panel:

- a) confirm the ordinary minutes of its meeting, held on Tuesday, 8 September 2015, as a true and correct record.

4 Extraordinary Business

Section 46A(7) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 (as amended) states:

“An item that is not on the agenda for a meeting may be dealt with at that meeting if-

- (a) The local authority by resolution so decides; and
- (b) The presiding member explains at the meeting, at a time when it is open to the public,-
 - (i) The reason why the item is not on the agenda; and
 - (ii) The reason why the discussion of the item cannot be delayed until a subsequent meeting.”

Section 46A(7A) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 (as amended) states:

“Where an item is not on the agenda for a meeting,-

- (a) That item may be discussed at that meeting if-
 - (i) That item is a minor matter relating to the general business of the local authority; and
 - (ii) the presiding member explains at the beginning of the meeting, at a time when it is open to the public, that the item will be discussed at the meeting; but
- (b) no resolution, decision or recommendation may be made in respect of that item except to refer that item to a subsequent meeting of the local authority for further discussion.”

Public Input: St David's Memorial Church, Paul Baragwanath

File No.: CP2015/21120

Purpose

1. To provide the Heritage Advisory Panel with an update on the St David's Memorial Church.

Executive Summary

2. Paul Baragwanath will be in attendance to present an update to his previous presentation to the Heritage Advisory Panel on the St David's Memorial Church.

Recommendation/s

That the Heritage Advisory Panel:

- a) thank Paul Baragwanath for his presentation and update on the St David's Memorial Church.

Attachments

There are no attachments for this report.

Signatories

Author	Katherine Wilson - Democracy Advisor
Authoriser	Noel Reardon - Manager Heritage

Public input: Rob Thomas - presentation on behalf of Save the King's School Hanna Block

File No.: CP2015/21139

Purpose

1. To provide the Heritage Advisory Panel with a presentation on Save the King's School Hanna Block.

Executive Summary

2. Rob Thomas, Waitemata Local Board member will be in attendance to present to the Heritage Advisory Panel on the Kings School Hanna Block building.

Recommendation/s

That the Heritage Advisory Panel:

- a) thank Rob Thomas, Waitemata Local Board member for his presentation on the Kings School Hanna Block.

Attachments

No.	Title	Page
A	King's School Community Rally behind iconic Clock Tower	11

Signatories

Author	Katherine Wilson - Democracy Advisor
Authoriser	Noel Reardon - Manager Heritage

King's School Community rally behind iconic Clock Tower Building

A groundswell of support is growing within the King's and Auckland Communities requesting the King's School Board to reconsider its decision to demolish the School's iconic clock tower and historic Hanna Block.

Since the campaign was launched a month ago there has been a tidal-wave of comments on both the change.org petition page and "Save the historic King's School Hanna Block" facebook page from the public together with former pupils, former teachers, and even a former Acting Headmaster asking the King's School Board to reconsider its decision.

Former King's School pupil and Elected Member of Council Rob Thomas was shocked and surprised to hear the School had determined to demolish its iconic centrepiece building without consulting the wider King's and Auckland community:

"Concerned former pupils have met with the Headmaster and a letter was sent to the School Board requesting copies of Beca's Engineering Reports, the Salmond Reed Architect's August 2014 Heritage Impact Assessment and the brief provided to Warren Mahoney Architects. The Board has responded to say that, 'we are not prepared to release the experts' reports we commissioned.'"

In the School's Kingsway Magazine published in May 2015, it was stated that the Hanna Block complied with "the new earthquake standards of safety". It was further stated that, "we found that the cost to repair it and strengthen it was going to cost \$10 million." Copies of Beca's Engineering Reports were requested to enable the nature and extent of the repairs and strengthening (at the estimated cost of \$10 million) to be referred to an independent specialist engineer for peer review. The School is intending to spend \$30 million on a new replacement building.

Chartered Building Surveyor Tracey Hartley writes on the petition page that the fabrication of buildings such as the Hanna Block are widely misunderstood and can be repaired at a reasonable cost:

"I am a professional UK trained chartered building surveyor specialising in the repair of heritage buildings and have a degree in Construction. I have had nearly 30 years' experience working with existing buildings, 10 of those in New Zealand. The fabric of buildings such as the Hanna Block is widely misunderstood in NZ. I advised on the successful repair of Auckland Girls Grammar School A Block which had similar problems 7 years ago with salts and a filled cavity (for earthquake strengthening). These buildings can be repaired and at reasonable cost."

Civil and Structural Consulting Engineer and former pupil Murray Spicer says there maybe alternative ways to repair and protect the building:

"It appears that an alternative repair and protection methodology adopting cathodic protection strategies has not been investigated to date. Cathodic protection has existed as an anti-steel corrosion technique for over a hundred years, and specific systems have been developed over the last 25 or more years to protect reinforced concrete building structures. In particular, cathodic protection was used for a nine-storey apartment block located in Auckland's central city which was constructed in 1934 and was successfully protected and remediated circa 1990."

“Contech have provided preliminary advice to indicate the cost of protecting the Hanna Building which, notwithstanding the very limited information available at this stage, indicates a substantial reduction on the costs indicated as being necessary to repair and protect the building by more conventional methods.”

Malcom Brown who has been the King’s School Architect for the past 35 years says:

“In my professional opinion, the present proposal to demolish the beautiful and iconic Hanna Block is incomprehensible. It is not necessary. It is logical and feasible to retain and strengthen this building to compliant and contemporary standards.”

The petition has drawn support from a number of heritage groups including Remuera Heritage, Civic Trust Auckland, Civic Trust Wellington, Civic Trust Christchurch, Historic Places Canterbury, the Whitestone Civic Trust, the British Heritage Alliance and The 20th Century Society in Britain.

The Auckland Civic Trust has written on the petition:

“It should not be necessary to campaign to save such a building as the Hanna Block but sadly it is, and we commend those who are putting in the huge effort we know is unfortunately required on an ongoing basis for our city’s heritage to be properly recognised and protected. The Hanna Block deserves to be included on Auckland Council’s schedule of significant historic heritage for a number of reasons, not the least of which is that its architect, Daniel B. Patterson, was responsible for the design of a number of other significant buildings in Auckland.

The Hanna Block is of undoubted importance to many of those who attended King’s School as pupils, and their families, as well as, we expect, the current generation of students at the school. It has been described by more than one former student as “the heart of the school” and recognised as an important part of the identity of King’s School. Furthermore, it is also greatly valued by those who live in the suburb of Remuera, as well as the wider community of Auckland (88% of whom, according to a recent Auckland Council’s People’s Panel survey, value their heritage). We all share the dismay when yet another part of the city is threatened with demolition, particularly when it is a landmark building. The city has lost so much, and many of the decisions that led to these losses and the people who made them have suffered much blame in the retrospective scrutiny.

If an older building is in need of modernising or restoration, this should not necessarily signal its destruction. Adaptive reuse of a building is a much better outcome than demolition in so many ways, and good architectural design options can achieve the desired improvements.”

The Architect Daniel Patterson is regarded by many as Auckland’s leading architect of his generation. After Daniel Patterson’s death in June 1962 he was praised for being the pioneer of ferro-concrete in the New Zealand media, “Mr Patterson designed what is believed to have been the first ferro-concrete building in New Zealand – Ellison Chambers in Queen St.” Ellison Chambers is a large six-storey building on Queen Street, currently listed as a Historic Place with Heritage New Zealand.

The Salmond Reed report commissioned in August 2014 assesses the Hanna Block as having, “considerable heritage significance”.

The Auckland Central Fire Station, built by Mr Patterson, proudly states on its website that the present City Station was built in 1944 and is an exceptional building architecturally. The King's School Hanna Block stands proudly with Mr Patterson's other iconic Auckland landmarks:

- Auckland's Central Fire Station, Pitt Street
- Mater Misericordia / Mercy Hospital, Mountain Road
- Ellison Chambers, Queen Street (NZ's first ferro-concrete building)
- Eight-Storey Paykel Building, Anzac Ave
- Gifford Building, Cnr High Street & Vulcan Lane
- Auckland Residence of the Governor-General, Mt Eden
- Significant buildings at St John's Theological College, Meadowbank
- St David's Church, Khyber Pass (under threat www.rememberthem.nz)
- St Columba, Grey Lynn
- St James, Orakei
- St Andrews, Kohimarama
- St Stephen's School, Bombay
- King's School Chapel of the Holy Child
- ASB Bank Buildings – Ponsonby, Greenlane, Khyber Pass
- Fire Stations – Remuera, St Heliers, Ponsonby (all demolished)
- Flying Angel Missions for Seamen building, Sturdee Street (demolished)
- L.D.Nathan Building, Fort Street (demolished)
- Frontage alterations to His Majesty's Theatre (demolished)

In recognition of his considerable architectural services to Auckland and the Anglican Diocese, Daniel Patterson was buried at St John's Theological College alongside John Kinder, John Elam and Archbishops including Sir Paul Reeves.

Pam Glenie, the granddaughter of the noted Architect, Daniel Paterson writes on the petition that the building sets the design standards for King's School:

"Patterson was the architect who effectively set the design standards which have governed the way King's School has developed since the Hanna Block was built. His architecture is timeless, and

appropriate for a school such as King's. All buildings created since that time have conformed to the original concept and stayed in keeping with the original designs.

Michael Gifford, former Headmaster of Scots College and former Associate an Executive Principal of Kristin School writes on the petition page that the Scots College Board "...chose to preserve this historic façade which still remains the focal point of the College, and which to old boys and Wellingtonians alike represents Scots College.

No doubt modernisation of the classroom spaces at King's School is needed and important, but once an historic and recognisable landmark building is destroyed, it is gone forever. Remember His Majesty's Theatre in Auckland? To those of us who loved the theatre it was 'here today, gone tomorrow'. This should be not the fate of the Hanna Block."

Former Acting Headmaster of King's School Malcolm Long writes on the petition that the School should be using the groundswell of support to fund the restoration:

"By our deeds are we known. If the Board of Governors and Headmaster reconsider this unfortunate decision, they will have done more to encourage old boys, ex-staff and even current families to financially support the building development than any amount of campaigning that they may be planning for the near future in support of their rebuilding plans."

Mr Thomas who was intimately involved in developing the Britomart heritage precinct believes the Hanna Block can be a revitalised inspiring space:

"Today's heritage buildings can be revitalised to create inspiring spaces which are energy efficient for modern flexible learning. If there was ever a notable New Zealand school with the ability to rally people behind, fund and restore a building it would be King's School.

With the huge loss of heritage within Christchurch it seems difficult to believe that a heritage building of this calibre and significance that complies with the current earthquake requirements is now at immediate risk of demolition."

The King's School Hanna Block is planned to be torn down this Christmas holidays.

Supporting information

1. Murray Spicer Letter
2. Malcolm Brown Letter
3. Daniel Boys Patterson Buildings1
4. Daniel Boys Patterson Building 2
5. Daniel Boys Patterson Obituary
6. Salmond Reed Heritage Impact Assessment November 2014
7. Photo Hanna Block Building
8. Photo of the St Davids

9. Photo of the Auckland Central Fire Station

10. Photo of the Ellison Chambers

Contact

Facebook <https://www.facebook.com/SaveKingsSchoolHannaBlock>

Petition <https://www.change.org/p/king-s-school-save-the-historic-king-s-school-hanna-block>

Rob Thomas rob@robthomas.co.nz 021 704423

Heritage Managers' update

File No.: CP2015/21291

Purpose

1. To update the members of the Heritage Advisory Panel on current issues and work of Auckland Council's Heritage Unit.

Executive Summary

2. Noel Reardon, Heritage Manager, to update the Heritage Advisory Panel on heritage projects and current issues. In particular, the pre-1944 survey work and the identification of places of interest; the Built Heritage Acquisition Fund and properties addressed by council; an update on St James and the State of the Environment report.

Recommendation/s

That the Heritage Advisory Panel:

- a) receive the update by Noel Reardon, Heritage Manager, on current heritage projects and issues

Attachments

There are no attachments for this report.

Signatories

Author	Peri Buckley - Team Leader Heritage Information Management
Authoriser	Noel Reardon - Manager Heritage