

Central Community Recycling Centre Design Options Comparison

Design Option	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3A	Option 3B
Design approach	Develop all community recycling centre activities in the central green area of the site. Use existing garden hall as the shop, the second hall for community hire and the historic building to continue as a leased building.	Develop drop off area in the existing hardstand of the eastern carpark. Utilise the existing hall for a shop and education space with the back office area used as workshops. The garden hall to continue as a hall for hire and the historic building to continue as a leased building.	Develop community recycling centre activates in the western area of the site. New build for use as a shop and workshops. Both community halls to continue as halls for hire and the Auckland Horticultural Council to continue occupying the historic building under their existing lease arrangement.	Develop community recycling centre activates in the western area of the site. Utilise the historic building for a shop and education space with the basement area used as workshops. The garden hall to continue as a hall for hire and the Auckland Horticultural Council to occupy the second hall under a new lease arrangement.
Health & Safety	Medium risk – A lot of activity around one entrance/exit point. Will need to manage the central area.	Medium risk – One way flow of traffic however mixture of drop off, vehicle and pedestrian movements in the same space will need to be managed.	High risk - A lot of activity around one entrance/exit point. Vehicle, pedestrian and drop off in one space plus the use of the carpark by the Auckland Horticultural Council.	Medium to High risk - A lot of activity around one entrance/exit point. Vehicle, pedestrian and drop off in one space will need to be managed.
Impact on immediate neighbours	Medium impact on western neighbours	Little to no impact to western neighbours	Medium-high impact on western neighbours	Medium-high impact on western neighbours
Impact on Hall for Hire	Low impact – current venue hire level of service not affected. Use of the hall for hire can be managed so that there is maximised undisturbed use.	High Impact on current level of service. Possible loss of revenue. Difficult to manage and maintain undisturbed use. This will likely change the type of groups that book the hall. Vehicle, pedestrian and drop off in one space plus the use of the carpark by Venue Hire patrons will cause a high level of activity.	Low impact – current venue hire level of service not affected. Has the least impact on the hall for hire users as the community recycling centre activity is separate. This option keeps two spaces available for the community to hire.	Has the least impact on the hall for hire users as the community recycling centre activity is separate. Option to maximise level of service for hall for hire by swap with proposed new Horticultural site. Maybe a new entrance could be made through existing office/kitchen.
Alignment with community and stakeholder input/feedback (integrative process)	Low – uses most of the green space, limited to no space for community gardens, difficult to achieve uninterrupted use for each activity. Some management needed to reduce impact to the receiving environment. However potential to utilise the creek and south-western corner in future.	High – majority of the green space is retained, options for community gardens, easier to achieve uninterrupted use for each activity. Doesn't impact on the receiving environment with lots of potential for the creek and south-western corner of the site.	Medium – retains some green space and options for community gardens. However potential impacts on the receiving environment which will need to be managed and could become a site feature (eg tiered rain gardens). Some limitations around the access to the creek for future use.	Medium – retains some green space and options for community gardens. However potential impacts on the receiving environment which will need to be managed and could become a site feature (eg tiered rain gardens). Some limitations around the access to the creek for future use.
Program / Resource	Consent issues are numerous but manageable, this will potentially	Consent issues are moderate and manageable and likely will not impact	Significant consent issues which are manageable but will potentially	Significant consent issues which are manageable but will potentially impact

Design Option	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3A	Option 3B
Management Act consents	impact build program with associated costs and time. Heritage concerns around access through wall to be managed and potential for contaminated land constraints.	build program or associated costs No obvious heritage or contamination issues for the initial phase.	impact build program with associated costs. Working adjacent to Meola Creek will need to be actively managed. Heritage concerns around access through the wall to be managed. Potential for contaminated land constraints.	build program with associated costs. Working adjacent to Meola Creek will need to be actively managed. Heritage concerns around access through the wall to be managed. Potential for contaminated land constraints.
Flexibility of use	As already built does not allow for expansion to the drop off area however options to expand into other areas of the site.	Available space allows for expansion of operation if the whole site is considered	As already built allows for very modest expansion to the drop off area however options to expand into other areas of the site.	As already built allows for very modest expansion to the drop off area however options to expand into other areas of the site.
Culture & Heritage	Remove section of stone wall for access, old gateway is dominated by traffic. Western area of the site and the creek available for future expansion (eg education and walking trail)	No heritage Issues. Western area of the site and the creek available for future expansion (eg education and walking trail)	Remove section of stone wall for access, old gateway is dominated by traffic. Working in the historic heritage area of the site. Warehouse may restrict future possibilities for the creek area	Remove section of stone wall for access, old gateway is dominated by traffic. Working in the historic heritage area of the site. Warehouse may restrict future possibilities for the creek area
Green space impacts, ecological capacity & health of site	Significant increase in ground coverage and storm water run-off to be managed. Significant reduction in permeable areas	Minor increase in ground coverage and storm water impacts. Easy to manage.	Moderate increase in ground coverage and storm water run-off to manage. Reduced permeable areas	Moderate increase in ground coverage and storm water run-off to manage. Reduced permeable areas
Contributing to healthy waters	Design does not address Meola Creek however all stormwater run-off from the impermeable areas will need to be treated	Design does not address Meola Creek.	Yes, adjacency requires treatment for all storm water and good management of the activities due to proximity	Yes, adjacency requires treatment for all storm water and good management of the activities due to proximity
Traffic	Signalised junction allows exit both ways. Controlled pedestrian crossing of entranceway.	Likely left turn exit only. No control around pedestrian crossing of access way.	Signalised junction allows exit both ways. Controlled pedestrian crossing of entranceway.	Signalised junction allows exit both ways. Controlled pedestrian crossing of entranceway.
Access / turning/ drop off	Tight entry turn and potential queuing in bus lane/on road. Drop off area is inclined.	Existing access is good Room for queuing Easy linear drop off zone	Tight entry turn and potential queuing in bus lane. Circulation roads are inclined Easy linear drop off zone	Tight entry turn and potential queuing in bus lane. Circulation roads are inclined Easy linear drop off zone
Parking	Overall adequate with conflict at peak times	Overall adequate with conflict at peak times	Overall adequate with conflict at peak times	Overall adequate with conflict at peak times
Future busway impact	Moderate – may impact the shop and yard area	High – will impact the workshops and drop off area	Low – May impact the warehouse however this can be considered during detailed design if required	Low – May impact the warehouse however this can be considered during detailed design if required
Achieving Living Building Challenge	Significant new build and infrastructure - so fees and additional	Significant reuse of existing buildings thus modest fees and additional	Significant new build and infrastructure - so fees and	Significant reuse of existing buildings thus modest fees and additional capital

Design Option	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3A	Option 3B
sustainability certification	capital costs are higher to achieve this	capital costs to achieve this	additional capital costs are higher to achieve this	costs to achieve this however use of historic building might compromise ability to achieve this.
Road frontage exposure	New workshops address street but increase Resource Management Act consent issues	Converted Hall/ Shop has good existing frontage with signage	Minimal due to small building and facade set back from street	Minimal due to small building and facade set back from street
Security	Increased usage of site will improve safety and reduce vandalism	Increased usage of site will improve safety and reduce vandalism	Increased usage of site will improve safety and reduce vandalism	Increased usage of site will improve safety and reduce vandalism
Contaminated land	Potential	None anticipated	Potential	Potential
Excavation works	Significant	Minor	Significant	Moderate

Note: The above table was developed as background information for the workshop held on the 16 February 2017 with the Albert-Eden, Waitemata and Puketāpapa Local Boards. It does not include mana whenua design option preference as this was unavailable at that time.