

BUILT HERITAGE SPECIALIST MEMO

Date: 16 November 2016
To: Angela Taganahan - Planner
From: Garry Glasgow – Conservation Architect
Application Address: 7 Arthur Street, Ponsonby.
Application Number: R/LUC/2016/ 3407

Thank you for forwarding this application for Built Heritage assessment. Do not hesitate to contact me for clarification or discussion.

1. APPLICATION PROPOSAL

The applicant seeks Resource Consent to make changes to the structures on the above noted property. The proposal is described in the application material, but principally consists of the following:

- Demolish existing structures.
- Construct a new dwelling.
- Construct structures in the front yard.

2. SITE INFORMATION:

This site is on the east side of the street. The street possesses a majority of early twentieth century villa dwellings together with several later infill dwellings. Cladding materials in the locality are typically paint finished, with roofs of profiled steel. Walls and joinery are predominantly constructed of timber.

3. DOCUMENTS ASSESSED:

The assessment is based on a review of the following materials:

Drawings CD-04 to CD-11 prepared by McKinney & Windeatt and dated 26 October 2016.

4. AUCKLAND UNITARY PLAN (OPERATIVE IN PART)

5.1 This site is located in the Special Character Areas Overlay (Residential: Isthmus A)
Section D18.2 of the PAUP sets out the following Objectives:

- (1) The special character values of the area, as identified in the special character area statement are maintained and enhanced.*
- (2) The physical attributes that define, contribute to, or support the special character of the area are retained, including:*
 - (a) built form, design and architectural values of buildings and their contexts;*
 - (b) streetscape qualities and cohesiveness, including historical form of subdivision and patterns of streets and roads; and*

(c) the relationship of built form to landscape qualities and/or natural features including topography, vegetation, trees, and open spaces.

(3) The adverse effects of subdivision, use and development on the identified special character values of the area are avoided, remedied or mitigated.

5.2 The proposal is for demolition of an existing building. Section D18.4.1 Activity Table – Residential determines that Consent is required under (Activity A3) The second part of the proposal is for construction of a new building. Section D18.4.1 Activity Table – Residential determines that Consent is required under (Activity A5)



AERIAL VIEW OF ARTHUR STREET

5.3 The proposal is reviewed in relation to the Objectives D18.2, the policies D18.3 and the following sections:

Character Statement in Schedule 15.1.7.2 Special Character Overlay – Residential: Isthmus A Matters of Discretion D18.8.1.1(2)

Assessment Criteria D18.8.2.1(1): (a) and (b) - Demolition

Assessment Criteria D18.8.2.1(3): (a) and (b) – New buildings.

D18.6.1.7.(1): Fences, walls and other structures, or any combination of these, in the Special Character Areas Overlay - Residential must not exceed a height of 1.2m above ground level.

5. COMMENT UPON TRADITIONAL SPECIAL CHARACTER DWELLINGS

Traditional dwellings consist of a main cubic structure with a gable or hip roof over. The main roof of the simpler dwellings is normally symmetrical in form either side of the main ridges and has a moderate pitch.

The gable or hip roofed structure has a stud height greater than three metres and is the dominant element. Attached accretions are set below the main eaves level, possess a clear and separate articulation, are smaller in scale and of simple form - often with a lean-to roof of very low pitch.

Villa dwellings had hip roof forms with small boxed overhangs while Bungalow forms had symmetrical gable roof forms of moderate pitch with very wide eave and verge overhangs which provided for strong shadow lines around the edges of the building accentuating the lower pitch gable roof form.

Traditional dwellings are generally clad with corrugated steel or masonry tile roofing.

The most common wall claddings are horizontal timber weatherboards, although there are examples of brick in natural and in cement rendered finish. Claddings are universally finished with paint finishes

The front of the dwelling generally contains an entrance porch or a verandah. While this structure is small in scale it is usually highly detailed and provided a major prestigious building element at the important pedestrian entrance to the house.

Window joinery is an important element in establishing the prestigious nature of a dwelling, and the occupier. The stud height provided tall window frames with a distinct vertical proportioning. The joinery frames are always set within the surface of the walls to provide a traditional window to wall ratio, and provides for solid corners to the building forms.

The joinery generally consists of separate frames with vertically proportioned sashes and doors. The door and window frames are consistent in the alignment of sills and heads around the building.



6. OVERALL PLAN STATUS

As the most restrictive activity status applies under the Resource management Act the application is assessed as a restricted discretionary activity.

7. ASSESSMENT - DEMOLITION

The new rules under the PAUP are generally the same as the rules under the former Residential 1 zone.

I have viewed the former assessment by Mr. Blair Hastings (19 August 2016) and generally concur with his analysis.

The last Criterion relates to the design of the new building which I will cover below.

8. COMMENT UPON NEW BUILDINGS

New dwellings frequently have quite different stud heights and space layouts to that of a traditional dwelling.

Traditional buildings generally provide building elements facing to the street which acknowledge and address the street. This is achieved by the placement of window joinery, entrance door, and entrance verandah/porch elements.

The arrangement of a building design with contemporary space dimensions will generally not provide a direct replica of a traditional building design. A new building should not attempt to do this.

The desire for garaging which never existed in traditional buildings provides a particular design conundrum, with a wide and blank garage door providing a street facing element, which does not easily meet the criteria.

Rather a new building should provide a form which accepts that it is of the period within which it is constructed, and which is complimentary with the neighbouring traditional buildings.

It is possible to achieve this by, for example, by designing a new building using some sympathetic devices such as:

- Building cladding materials which either match with the traditional materials or which acknowledge the texture of traditional materials;
- Building exterior finishes similar to those on original traditional buildings in the locality;
- Building forms and building bulk with a street view similar to those within traditional buildings;
- Modelling of buildings to break down the scale of a new and larger building.
- Roof forms which acknowledge the forms on original traditional local buildings;
- A friendly street face design which provides interaction with the street;
- A consistency of joinery form where within the street view. This can be achieved in a variety of ways including the vertical proportioning of joinery elements and by maintaining a consistent alignment of heads and sills around the dwelling.

9. ASSESSMENT - CONSTRUCT A NEW DWELLING:

Exterior detail includes:

- Metal roofing with a lineal trough form;
- Solid masonry wall structure with repeated horizontal recessed joints at 200 centres;
- A “verandah” element across the front of the building;
- Metal joinery with vertically proportioned elements and a painted finish.

The proposed house has derived aspects of building detail from more than one building type from prior to the Second World War.

From the street the building has a roof with an approximately 30 degree hip form as found in traditional villa dwellings. This is tantalisingly interrupted in two places for roof lights and will provide an overall appearance and silhouette of the hip form found in the locality.

A lower flat roof sits forward of the main hip roof and this covers the front porch area and also projects forward of the glazed garage. This provides a visual connection with the form of the verandah across the front of many dwellings in the locality.

There is a lower pitch on an upper building element set to the rear but this will be camouflaged from the street view by the main building bulk.

The building has a three level appearance at the rear which is a consequence of the basement level permitted by the slope of the ground.

The joinery to the sides of the main building are repeated narrow vertically proportioned windows. These windows maintain a consistent head and sill alignment and align also with the joinery in the street wall. The street facing joinery consists of vertically proportioned door elements set within large frames, to the house and to the garage. The glazed elements avoid the impact of frequent modern blank facades and provide a strong feeling of interaction with the street.

The frames are set back in the shadow of the front verandah reducing the immediacy of the window elements and highlighting the verandah space.

This is a clearly modern interpretation including a version of the various component elements of traditional dwellings.

10. CONCLUSION:

Unitary Plan Assessment Criteria D18.8.2.1(3)(b)

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (i) whether the design and external appearance of the proposed building is compatible with the streetscape and the identified special character of the area.

The house provides a solid and hip roofed dwelling with a strong shadow-creating full width front verandah. This is a modern interpretation of the various villa elements.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (ii) whether the form, mass, proportion and scale of the building is compatible with the special character of the area.

The building has a similar width to that of a return-verandah villa. The building is set across the width of the site and set off the side boundaries of the site, as for other local buildings. This building has a similar depth to that of a larger traditional dwelling. The street view displays the appearance of a single storey hip roofed dwelling.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (iv) whether materials used maintain the integrity of, and have a clear relationship to, the traditional character and materials of buildings in the street.

The materials differ from the traditional. The house is constructed of masonry with a ribbed zinc surface metal roof. The roof carries on the lineal texture in another form. The wall surfaces will be detailed to accentuate the horizontal joints and conceal the vertical joints, followed with a surface over-coating. The consequent horizontal pattern of shadow-lines is a reasonable approximation of the texture of the common weatherboard claddings and demonstrates a relationship to these traditional wall textures. Joinery is metal framed in a similar manner to that of traditional 1920s dwellings.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (v) whether those parts of a building which are highly visible to the street maintain a window to wall ratio visible from the street that is similar to that surviving original predominant character buildings in the street.

The building maintains a series of separate vertically proportioned windows set within wall surfaces on the side walls. The front wall spans between the two solid and thick side walls. There is a considerable set-back to the main wall and a lesser set-back to the front of the garage wall, so that these receive varying degrees of front wall shadowing.

The main house front wall and the garage front wall have very large glazed frames which fill almost the complete area between the end walls. This results in a proportion of glazing to solid which is higher than traditional. However, the doors within these frames are appropriately vertically proportioned and maintain an alignment with joinery in the side walls.

DOES NOT MEET WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (vi) whether the building is located on a site that reflects the original subdivision and development patterns existing in the street, particularly in situations where development is occurring on an amalgamated site so as to maintain the 'grain' of the area in terms of the size, spacing and rhythm of street front buildings.

The site boundaries are unchanged.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (viii) whether the building has a roof form that is compatible with the traditional roof forms predominant in the special character area and identified in the special character statement.

The hip roof form together with the lineal metal cladding is considered a reasonable response to traditional roof forms

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (iii) whether the building preserves the sense of visual frontage access and interactivity between residential buildings and the street, and does not present blank or near-blank façades to the street.

The building does not present a blank façade to the street.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERIA

(D18.8.2.1(3)(b) vii) whether particular attention has been paid to the continuity of the front façade alignment to the street.

The set-backs along the street are varied with three garages built up to the street boundary and an average set-back of about 2.8 metres.

The proposed building is set back a distance of between 3 and 4.5 metres from the street boundary, which leaves a reasonable space in front of the dwelling for landscape purposes.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERION

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (ix) whether the provision of any vehicle access and parking complements the character of the streetscape, having particular regard to location, design, detailing, use of materials and landscaping.

D18.8.2.1(3)(b) (x) whether garages and carports allow good visibility of the building from the street, and where possible are located to the rear of, underneath (where appropriate in terms of topography), or alongside the building on the site.

The garage is included within the main house.

GENERALLY MEETS WITH CRITERIA

The applicant has made some effort to avoid the appearance of a blank and monotonous street frontage by use of glazed garage doors to camouflage this presence. In the process the street frontage now has a higher than traditional proportion of glazing to solid. The side walls which face the neighbouring dwellings clearly display a vertically-proportioned window-within-wall appearance. The glazed areas to the front are detailed to provide vertically proportioned door elements. The front wall is in addition set back in shadow of the verandah across the street frontage. The bulk, proportion and roof form are all compatible with traditional local dwellings. The building is clearly a modern interpretation which attempts to combine modern desires within a sympathetic form.

Overall the proposal can be supported.

Garry Glasgow
Conservation Architect

Continued.....

PROPOSED CONDITIONS:

1. All exterior exposed wall, balustrade and joinery surfaces shall be painted with an opaque paint finish to provide a colour tone which is complimentary with the finishes on existing building surfaces in the neighbourhood.
2. Exterior exposed concrete masonry shall be finished to conceal the natural bond, with all vertical joints carefully concealed. This will provide for a distinct repeated regularly spaced horizontal recess. This will provide a visual link to the shadow lines of the wide traditional weatherboards.
3. Alternatively the concrete masonry may be completely flush rendered with a paint finish over the top.
4. New fences or structures set within the front yard shall comply with the D18.6.1.7.(1).

END OF DOCUMENT