Minutes of a meeting of the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee held in the Room 1, Level 26, 135 Albert St, Auckland on Thursday, 7 June 2018 at 9.33am.

**PRESENT**

**Chairperson**  
Hon Phil Goff, CNZM, JP  

**Deputy Chairperson**  
Hon Christine Fletcher, QSO  

**Members**  
Cr Josephine Bartley  
Cr Ross Clow  
Cr Chris Darby  
Cr Richard Hills  
Cr Penny Hulse  
Cr Desley Simpson, JP  

**Ex-officio**  
Deputy Mayor Bill Cashmore  
IMSB Member David Taipari  

From 10.32am, item 10, until 1.38pm, item C3  
Until 11.46am, item C2  
Until 12.23pm, item C2

**ALSO PRESENT**

Cr Cathy Casey  
Until 12.23pm, item C2
1 Apologies
Resolution number APP/2018/25
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
   a) accept the apologies from Cr R Clow for lateness and Cr P Hulse for early
depture on council business.
CARRIED

2 Declaration of Interest
There were no declarations of interest.

3 Confirmation of Minutes
Resolution number APP/2018/26
MOVED by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher, seconded by Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
   a) confirm the ordinary minutes of its meeting, held on Thursday, 3 May 2018,
including the confidential section, as a true and correct record.
CARRIED

4 Petitions
There were no petitions.

5 Public Input
There was no public input.

6 Local Board Input
There was no local board input.

7 Extraordinary Business
There was no extraordinary business.

8 Notices of Motion
There were no notices of motion.
9 Value for Money (s17A) quarterly progress reports

Resolution number APP/2018/27

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) receive the progress updates for the Value for Money (s17A) reviews on Three Waters, Domestic Waste Services, Communication & Engagement Services, and Investment Attraction and Global Partnerships.

b) note the combined value for money financial benefits from the Three Waters, Domestic Waste Services, Communication & Engagement Services, total $232 million in the next 2 years.

CARRIED

Attachments

A 7 June 2018 Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee, Item 9 - Value for Money (s17A) quarterly progress reports

10 Value for Money (s17A) Review programme

Cr R Clow entered the meeting at 10.32 am.

Resolution number APP/2018/28

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) receive the Parks and Open Spaces Value for Money (s17A) Review 2018 report

b) note Parks and Open Spaces related recommendations be referred to a workshop and reported further to this committee.

c) receive the Group Procurement Value for Money (s17A) Review 2018 report

d) endorse the recommendations contained in the Group Procurement Value for Money (s17A) Review 2018 report and recommend that the Governing Body approve the report and its recommendations.

CARRIED

11 Value for Money (s17A) forward work programme

Resolution number APP/2018/29

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) approve the revised Value for Money (s17A) forward work programme.

CARRIED
12 **Board Performance Review Framework**

Resolution number APP/2018/30

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

**That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:**

a) approve the development of a board performance review framework

b) approve, in principle, the following elements of a board performance review framework, those being that the reviews:

i) be held on a biennial basis, with monitoring of agreed performance improvement initiatives

ii) be undertaken by an independent, external reviewer

iii) be based on a methodology that includes qualitative, quantitative and observational approaches

iv) include relevant assessment criteria that relate to the board’s governance role, practices and responsibilities, including strategy, risk and compliance, performance and board culture

v) assess the board as-a-whole, the individual board members and the chair of the board

vi) seek feedback from senior management as well as individual board members

vii) allow for input from the shareholder into the themes or topic areas evaluated

viii) provide a written report to the CCO board summarising findings and suggesting areas for improvement

ix) provide council with a high-level feedback report addressing theme areas and areas of focus for improvement

c) approve that the board performance review process will be board-led

d) approve that the chairs of the CCO boards be required on at least an annual basis to discuss with the mayor, the relevant chair of the committee and the manager, CCO governance and external partnerships, the progress the board is making in addressing any areas of improvements

e) agree that the substantive CCO boards are provided with an information report on the proposed framework for feedback

f) agree that the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee agree to workshop the shareholder questions to be included in board performance reviews

g) agree that the recommended board performance review framework is piloted with Auckland Transport in 2018

h) agree that the board performance review framework is included in the Governance Manual for substantive CCOs.

CARRIED
13 Consideration of Extraordinary Items

There was no consideration of extraordinary items.

14 Procedural motion to exclude the public

Cr P Hulse left the meeting at 11.28 am.

Resolution number APP/2018/31

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) exclude the public from the following part(s) of the proceedings of this meeting.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution follows.

This resolution is made in reliance on section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by section 6 or section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public, as follows:

C1 Approve the council-appointed board member to the Auckland Regional Amenities Funding Board

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information regarding the candidates who have applied for the three board member vacancies on the Auckland Regional Amenities Funding Board.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C2 Shortlist candidates for chair vacancies on Auckland Council’s Council Controlled Organisations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information regarding the candidates who have applied for the three chair vacancies on the CCOs.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### C3 Chief Executive’s Employment Review: Part Two

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7. | s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person.  
s7(2)(i) - The withholding of the information is necessary to enable the local authority to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations).  
In particular, the committee will discuss the performance of the chief executive, which may include past and present performance, terms and conditions of employment, remuneration and future employment conditions. | s48(1)(a) - The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7. |

The text of these resolutions is made available to the public who are present at the meeting and form part of the minutes of the meeting.

CARRIED

11.30 am The public was excluded.

Resolutions in relation to the confidential items are recorded in the confidential section of these minutes and are not publicly available.

1.09pm The public was re-admitted.

**RESTATEMENTS**

It was resolved while the public was excluded:

**C1 Approve the council-appointed board member to the Auckland Regional Amenities Funding Board**

Resolution number APP/2018/32

MOVED by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher, seconded by Cr J Bartley:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee

c) agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential until the conclusion of the appointment process after which the decisions will be made publicly available.

d) note that the report must remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report.
C2 Shortlist candidates for chair vacancies on Auckland Council’s Council Controlled Organisations

Resolution number APP/2018/35

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr C Darby:

Restatement

c) agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential until the conclusion of the appointment process after which the decisions will be made publicly available.

d) note that the report must remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report.

C3 Chief Executive’s Employment Review: Part Two

Resolution number APP/2018/36

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

Restatement

c) agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential, until after the Governing Body has considered the chief executive’s employment review on 28 June 2018, and that advice will be provided by staff on which documents can be made publicly available.

1.10 pm

The Chairperson thanked Members for their attendance and attention to business and declared the meeting closed.

CONFIRMED AS A TRUE AND CORRECT RECORD AT A MEETING OF THE APPOINTMENTS, PERFORMANCE REVIEW AND VALUE FOR MONEY COMMITTEE HELD ON

DATE:..................................................................................

CHAIRPERSON:.....................................................................