Minutes of a meeting of the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee held in the Boardroom, Ground Floor, Auckland Town Hall on Thursday, 6 December 2018 at 10.30am.

PRESENT

Chairperson
Mayor Hon Phil Goff, CNZM, JP
Deputy Chairperson
Cr Hon Christine Fletcher, QSO
Members
Cr Josephine Bartley
Cr Ross Clow
Cr Richard Hills
Cr Penny Hulse
Cr Desley Simpson, JP

Ex-officio
Deputy Mayor Cr Bill Cashmore
IMSB Chair David Taipari

ABSENT

Cr Chris Darby

ALSO PRESENT

Dr Cr Cathy Casey
1 Apologies

Resolution number APP/2018/83
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by IMSB Chair D Taipari:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
a) accept the apologies from Cr R Clow for lateness and Cr C Darby for absence on council business.
CARRIED

2 Declaration of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

3 Confirmation of Minutes

Resolution number APP/2018/84
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
a) confirm the ordinary minutes of its meeting, held on Thursday, 1 November 2018, including the confidential section, as a true and correct record.
CARRIED

4 Petitions

There were no petitions.

5 Public Input

There was no public input.

6 Local Board Input

There was no local board input.

7 Extraordinary Business

There was no extraordinary business.
8 Value for Money (s17A) quarterly progress reports
Resolution number APP/2018/85
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
a) receive the progress updates for the Value for Money (s17A) reviews on:
   • Three Waters
   • Domestic Waste Services
   • Communication and Engagement Services
   • Investment Attraction and Global Partnerships
   • Group Procurement.
CARRIED

9 Value for Money ICT review
Resolution number APP/2018/86
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
a) receive the Information, Communication and Technology Value for Money Review 2018 report.
b) endorse the recommendations set out in clause c) below and recommend that the Governing Body approve the reports and their recommendations.
c) recommend that the council’s chief executive collaborate with the chief executives of the council-controlled organisations to:
   i) develop and implement a group approach to governing Information, Communication and Technology for items of common group interest. It is anticipated that this will include:
      A) key guiding principles balancing each organisation’s needs and current Information, Communication and Technology expertise with the benefits of collaboration mandate to participate and use
      B) consideration of appropriate operating models including centres of expertise and other shared arrangements to reduce duplication and improve efficiency
      C) an implementation plan.
   ii) design and implement a consistent group-wide approach for managing data centres. It is anticipated that this will include:
      A) appropriate service levels required from a data centre segmented, where appropriate, by organisation and service requirement, including an appropriate assessment of risk
      B) an assessment of current data centre providers and any options that may be part of the All of Government contracts
      C) a framework to manage supplier relationship(s) and develop a strategic group approach to deliver future benefits
      D) an agreed plan on approaches to reduce, if applicable, future demand for data centre capacity.
iii) build on the collaborative approach in the Group Procurement Policy by building an Information, Communication and Technology Procurement Strategy and Category Management Plan. It is anticipated that this will include:

A) Information, Communication and Technology services which are common across the group and where a collaborative approach to procurement would be beneficial

B) suppliers who are shared across the group where a collaborative approach to ongoing supplier management would be beneficial

C) Information, Communication and Technology services where the All of Government procurement contracts will be used.

CARRIED

10 Process for the appointment of a trustee to Māngere Mountain Education Trust

Resolution number APP/2018/87

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note that there is a confidential report on today’s committee agenda with a recommendation on the appointment of a trustee to the board of the Māngere Mountain Education Trust.

CARRIED

11 Process for appointment of board members to the Community and Education Trust - COMET

Resolution number APP/2018/88

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note that there is a confidential report on this meeting agenda with recommendations regarding the appointment of trustees to the board of Community Education Trust Auckland – COMET.

CARRIED

12 Update report on the process of appointing directors and board interns to the boards of the substantive council-controlled organisations

Resolution number APP/2018/89

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note that three confidential reports are included on today’s committee agenda that provide information to make decisions on the:

i) appointment of candidates for the director vacancies on Auckland Transport and Regional Facilities Auckland

ii) appointment of candidates for the board intern vacancies on five substantive council-controlled organisations
(iii) approval to commence the 2019 board appointment programme for Watercare Services Limited including approving reappointments, and the skills required (if any) to fill any vacancies and appoint selection panel members

b) note that the reports are confidential due to the personal information contained in them.

CARRIED

13 Appointment of selection panel members for the 2019 board appointment programme

Cr R Clow entered the meeting at 11.17 am.

Note: changes to the original motion were incorporated with the addition of clause c), with the agreement of the meeting.

Resolution number APP/2018/90

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) appoint one selection panel member and one alternate selection panel member for the vacancies on the council-controlled organisations for the 2019 board appointment programme, as follows:

i) Auckland Tourism Events Economic Development Limited
   • Cr R Hills and Cr D Simpson

ii) Regional Facilities Auckland
   • Cr D Simpson and Cr J Bartley

iii) Auckland Transport
   • Board appointments: Cr C Darby, Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore, and Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher
   • Chair appointments: Mayor P Goff, Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore, Cr C Darby and IMSB Chair D Taipari

iv) Panuku Development Auckland Limited
   • Cr J Bartley and Cr C Darby

v) Watercare Services Limited
   • Cr P Hulse, Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore, and IMSB Member R Blair

b) appoint one representative (and an alternate representative) from the Independent Māori Statutory Board to the selection panels for the vacancies on the council-controlled organisations for the 2019 board appointment programme.

c) appoint Cr P Hulse to the enduring pool of councillors for board appointments to the substantive council controlled organisations.

CARRIED
14 Appointments and Performance Review Committee Information Report - 6 December 2018

Resolution number APP/2018/91

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) receive the information report – 6 December 2018.

CARRIED

15 Consideration of Extraordinary Items

There was no consideration of extraordinary items.

16 Procedural motion to exclude the public

Resolution number APP/2018/92

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) exclude the public from the following part(s) of the proceedings of this meeting.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution follows.

This resolution is made in reliance on section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by section 6 or section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public, as follows:

C1 Confidential: Appointment of board members to the Community Education Trust Auckland - COMET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(e) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains information related to qualifications of private individuals as appointees of a CCO.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### C2  Confidential: Appointment of a trustee to the Mangere Mountain Education Trust

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about candidates who have applied for the five board intern vacancies on the CCOs.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C3  Confidential: Appointment of directors to Auckland Transport and Regional Facilities Auckland

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about candidates who have applied for the two director vacancies on Regional Facilities Auckland and Auckland Transport.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C4  Confidential: Director appointments to Watercare Services Limited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about directors on the board of Watercare Services Limited.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C5  Confidential: Appointment of board interns to Auckland’s council-controlled organisations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about candidates who have applied for the five board intern vacancies on the CCOs.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The text of these resolutions is made available to the public who are present at the meeting and form part of the minutes of the meeting.

CARRIED

11.48 pm  The public was excluded.

Resolutions in relation to the confidential items are recorded in the confidential section of these minutes and are not publicly available.

12.28 pm  The public was re-admitted.

RESTATEMENTS

It was resolved while the public was excluded:

C1  Confidential: Appointment of board members to the Community Education Trust Auckland - COMET
Resolution number APP/2018/93
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:
Restatement
c)  note that the report and attachments will remain confidential until the conclusion of the appointment process after which the decisions will be made publicly available. The report must stay confidential due to the information relating to individuals contained in the report.

C2  Confidential: Appointment of a trustee to the Māngere Mountain Education Trust
Resolution number APP/2018/94
MOVED by Cr P Hulse, seconded by Cr J Bartley:
Restatement
c)  note that the report and attachments will remain confidential until the conclusion of the appointment process after which the decisions will be made publicly available. The report must stay confidential due to the information relating to individuals contained in the report.

C3  Confidential: Appointment of directors to Auckland Transport and Regional Facilities Auckland
Resolution number APP/2018/96
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:
Restatement
c)  agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential due to the private information relating to all candidates who have applied, been reviewed and/or interviewed for the two director vacancies on Auckland Council’s council-controlled organisations
d)  agree that the appointment decision will be made publicly available at the completion of the director vacancy appointment process and once the due diligence requirements and reference checks have been satisfied.
C4  Confidential: Director appointments to Watercare Services Limited
Resolution number APP/2018/97
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore:
Restatement
e) note that the report and attachments will remain confidential until the conclusion of the appointment process after which the decisions will be made publicly available. The report must stay confidential due to the information relating to individuals contained in the report.

C5  Confidential: Appointment of board interns to Auckland's council-controlled organisations
Resolution number APP/2018/95
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr P Hulse:
Restatement
d) agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential due to the private information relation to all candidates who have applied, been reviewed and/or interviewed for the five board intern vacancies on Auckland Council’s council-controlled organisations
e) agree that the appointment decision will be made publicly available at the completion of the board intern appointment process and once the due diligence requirements and reference checks have been satisfied.

12.29 pm The Chairperson thanked Members for their attendance and attention to business and declared the meeting closed.

CONFIRMED AS A TRUE AND CORRECT RECORD AT A MEETING OF THE APPOINTMENTS, PERFORMANCE REVIEW AND VALUE FOR MONEY COMMITTEE HELD ON

DATE:.................................................................................................

CHAIRPERSON:..............................................................................