# Komiti Tohu me te Arotake Tūranga Mahi, me te Rite o te Whiwhi ki Tā Tērā i Utu Ai / Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee

## OPEN MINUTES

Minutes of a meeting of the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee held in the Room 1, Level 26, 135 Albert St, Auckland on Thursday, 6 June 2019 at 9.34am.

### PRESENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>Hon Phil Goff, CNZM, JP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputy Chairperson</td>
<td>Cr Hon Christine Fletcher, QSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members</td>
<td>Cr Ross Clow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cr Chris Darby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cr Richard Hills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cr Penny Hulse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cr Desley Simpson, JP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex-officio</td>
<td>Deputy Mayor Cr Bill Cashmore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IMSB Chair David Taipari</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.38am</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cr Penny Hulse From 9.38am, Item 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.43am</td>
<td></td>
<td>Cr Desley Simpson, JP From 9.43am, Item 8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ABSENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Member</td>
<td>Cr Josephine Bartley</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ALSO PRESENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cr W Walker</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1 Apologies

Resolution number APP/2019/34

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) accept the apology from Cr J Bartley for absence; Cr R Hills for lateness on council business; and IMSB Chair D Taipari for lateness.

CARRIED

2 Declaration of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

3 Confirmation of Minutes

Resolution number APP/2019/35

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) confirm the ordinary minutes of its meeting, held on Wednesday, 1 May 2019, including the confidential section, as a true and correct record.

CARRIED

4 Petitions

There were no petitions.

5 Public Input

There was no public input.

6 Local Board Input

There was no local board input.

7 Extraordinary Business

There was no extraordinary business.
8 Value for Money Finance Review

Cr R Hills joined the meeting at 9.38am.
IMSB Chair D Taipari joined the meeting at 9.42am
Cr P Hulse joined the meeting at 9.43am.

Resolution number APP/2019/36

MOVED by Cr D Simpson, seconded by Mayor P Goff:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) receive the Finance Value for Money Review 2019 report

b) agree to recommend to the Governing Body that the council’s chief executive collaborates with the chief executives of the council-controlled organisations to:

i) develop and implement a shared services strategy and operating model for all back-office services including:

A) key guiding principles

B) the appropriate operating model to deliver efficient and effective shared services

C) establishing the appropriate shared service governance structure and decision-making principles with appropriate sponsorship and representation from all Group organisations

D) establishing a mandate to use in future Council Controlled Organisations Statements of Intent and in council policies

E) assess the potential future efficiency and productivity benefits that increased use of robotics and AI and how the Group may collectively leverage these benefits

ii) design and implement a strategy for the management of Group financial information:

A) determining the key information that is required in the Group plan to report cycle, for each Long-term Plan as part of a three-year planning calendar

B) including principles for how the information is collected, accessed and used

C) establishing appropriate data governance and controls

D) develop a business case for implementing the strategy including the selection of appropriate technology solutions and roadmap for future improvements

E) determine the appropriate analytical tools for self-service capability for staff

iii) simplify planning and reporting process by:

A) introducing a new planning and reporting framework aligned to Long-term Plan, annual budgeting and planning cycles and corporate strategy

B) ensuring all business performance reporting is driven on an exception basis by eliminating duplicated reporting effort
C) moving corporate reporting requirements to quarterly and on an exception basis
D) creating an embedded, enterprise wide Commercial and Finance team servicing the business through a single channel
E) simplifying the chart of accounts and controls around future changes.

9 Auckland Council progress on savings up to 31 March 2019

A PowerPoint presentation was given. A copy has been placed on the official minutes and is available on the Auckland Council website as a minutes attachment.

Note: changes to the original motion were incorporated with the addition of clause b) with the agreement of the meeting.

Cr P Hulse left the meeting at 10.32am
Cr R Clow left the meeting at 10.32am

Resolution number APP/2019/37

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) receive the Auckland Council progress report on savings up to 31 March 2019.

b) request staff to send the presentation to all councillors and local board members for their information and refer the report and presentation to the Finance and Performance Committee on 19 June 2019.

CARRIED

Attachments
A 6 June 2019, Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee, Item 9 - Auckland Council progress on savings up to 31 March 2019 - Presentation

10 Update report on board appointments to council-controlled organisations and Tamaki Redevelopment Company Limited.

Resolution number APP/2019/38

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note that two confidential reports are included on today’s committee agenda that provides information to:

i) make decisions on the shortlist candidates for the three Auckland Tourism, Events and Economic Development Limited director vacancies and one Panuku Development Auckland Limited director vacancy

ii) make decisions regarding the reappointment of two jointly-appointed directors on the board of Tamaki Redevelopment Company Limited.

b) note that the reports referred to in clause a) are confidential as they contain personal information relating to the candidates.

CARRIED
11 Completion report: Three Waters Value for Money review

Resolution number APP/2019/39

MOVED by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher, seconded by Mayor P Goff:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note the information contained in this report, on the completion of the three waters value for money review, enables transparency on the topic due for discussion in the public excluded part of the meeting

b) note that the confidential report contains information that could prejudice council's position in negotiations with three waters suppliers.

CARRIED

12 Consideration of Extraordinary Items

There was no consideration of extraordinary items.

Cr P Hulse returned to the meeting at 10.34am.

13 Procedural motion to exclude the public

Resolution number APP/2019/40

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) exclude the public from the following part(s) of the proceedings of this meeting.

b) agree that Ms Claire Dennison, Partner; Renisa Maki, Consultant; and Tim Scanlan, Consultant – Kerridge and Partners be permitted to remain for Confidential Item C2: Shortlist candidates for director vacancies on Auckland Tourism, Events and Economic Development and Panuku Development Auckland after the public has been excluded, because of her knowledge of matters which will help the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee in its decision-making.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution follows.

This resolution is made in reliance on section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by section 6 or section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public, as follows:
C1 CONFIDENTIAL : Board appointments to Tāmaki Redevelopment Company Limited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about current directors on the board of Tamaki Redevelopment Company Limited.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C2 CONFIDENTIAL - Shortlist candidates for director vacancies on Auckland Tourism, Events and Economic Development and Panuku Development Auckland

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about candidates who have applied for director vacancies on Auckland’s council-controlled organisations.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C3 CONFIDENTIAL: Completion report: Three Waters Value for Money review

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(i) - The withholding of the information is necessary to enable the local authority to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations). In particular, the report contains information that could prejudice council’s position in negotiations relating to procurement of water services.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The text of these resolutions is made available to the public who are present at the meeting and form part of the minutes of the meeting.

CARRIED
10.35am  The public was excluded.

Resolutions in relation to the confidential items are recorded in the confidential section of these minutes and are not publicly available.

11.19am  The public was re-admitted.

RESTATEMENTS

It was resolved while the public was excluded:

C1  CONFIDENTIAL : Board appointments to Tāmaki Redevelopment Company Limited

Resolution number APP/2019/41
MOVED by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher, seconded by Cr R Clow:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
  d) agree that the report and attachments will always remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report
  e) note that at the conclusion of the appointment process the decisions will be made publicly available.

C2  CONFIDENTIAL - Shortlist candidates for director vacancies on Auckland Tourism, Events and Economic Development and Panuku Development Auckland

Resolution number APP/2019/42
MOVED by IMSB Chair D Taipari, seconded by Cr R Clow:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
  d) agree that the report and attachments will always remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report
  e) note that at the conclusion of the appointment process the decisions will be made publicly available.

C3  CONFIDENTIAL: Completion report: Three Waters Value for Money review

Resolution number APP/2019/43
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr P Hulse:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
  c) confirm that the resolutions and report remain confidential until reasons for confidentiality no longer exist.
11.19am

The Chairperson thanked Members for their attendance and attention to business and declared the meeting closed.

CONFIRMED AS A TRUE AND CORRECT RECORD AT A MEETING OF THE APPOINTMENTS, PERFORMANCE REVIEW AND VALUE FOR MONEY COMMITTEE HELD ON

DATE:.................................................................

CHAIRPERSON:..................................................