

Attachment E: Assessment of advantages, disadvantages and risks for each option

Option One	Status Quo – no alcohol ban
Advantages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • no additional limitations on people’s rights and freedoms • no implementation costs for new signage.
Disadvantages / Risks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • left unaddressed alcohol related issues could continue to present safety risks, property damage and compound physical and emotional harm to community members as detailed in the request (Attachment B).
Risk mitigation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • continued use of surveillance cameras, continued Auckland Council response to noise and litter complaints, and continued Police response using existing powers under the Summary Offences Act 1981 and Crimes Act 1961 may help address issues as they arise.

Option Two	December and January weekend and public holiday alcohol ban (Recommended)
Advantages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • may help address alcohol-related crime or disorder through voluntary compliance or police enforcement. • there is sufficient evidence to justify a weekend and public holiday ban (majority of incidents occur on weekends and public holidays) reducing the potential for legal challenge.
Disadvantages / Risks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • alcohol consumption could move to residential addresses with no decrease in incidents. • incidents could continue to occur outside the alcohol ban times, and be more confusing to public, residents and Police. • an alcohol ban would impact everyone in the area including those residents and visitors who cause no issues and want to responsibly consume alcohol. • implementation costs for new signage.
Risk mitigation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • continued use of surveillance cameras, continued Auckland Council response to noise and litter complaints, and continued Police response using existing Summary Offences Act 1981 and Crimes Act 1961 powers can help address issues as they arise.

Option Three	24-hours, seven days a week alcohol ban
Advantages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • may help address alcohol-related crime or disorder through voluntary compliance or police enforcement. • supported by requester and Police.
Disadvantages / Risks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • insufficient evidence to justify a 24 hour, seven days a week alcohol ban (majority of incidents occur on weekends and public holidays). • an alcohol ban would impact everyone in the area including those residents and visitors who cause no issues and want to responsibly consume alcohol. • alcohol consumption could move to residential addresses with no decrease in incidents. • potential for successful legal challenge if court considers that the evidential threshold has not been met, or that the alcohol ban is not appropriate, proportionate or justified in light of the evidence provided. • implementation costs for new signage.
Risk mitigation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • continued use of surveillance cameras, continued Auckland Council response to noise and litter complaints, and continued Police response using existing Summary Offences Act 1981 and Crimes Act 1961 powers can help address issues as they arise. • the risk of legal challenge is considered low.