Minutes of a meeting of the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee held in the Room 1, Level 26, 135 Albert St, Auckland on Thursday, 5 September 2019 at 10.13am.

PRESENT

Chairperson
Hon Phil Goff, CNZM, JP

Deputy Chairperson
Cr Hon Christine Fletcher, QSO

Members
Cr Josephine Bartley
Cr Chris Darby
Cr Richard Hills
Cr Penny Hulse
Cr Desley Simpson, JP

Ex-officio
Deputy Mayor Cr Bill Cashmore
IMSB Chair David Taipari

ABSENT

Member
Cr Ross Clow
1  **Apologies**

There were no apologies.

2  **Declaration of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest.

3  **Confirmation of Minutes**

Resolution number APP/2019/62

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) confirm the ordinary minutes of its meeting, held on Thursday, 1 August 2019, including the confidential section, as a true and correct record.

   CARRIED

4  **Petitions**

There were no petitions.

5  **Public Input**

There was no public input.

6  **Local Board Input**

There was no local board input.

7  **Extraordinary Business**

There was no extraordinary business.

8  **Legal and Risk Value for Money report**

   *Cr P Hulse left the meeting at 10.18am.*
   *Cr P Hulse returned to the meeting at 10.30am.*

Resolution number APP/2019/63

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) agree to recommend to the Governing Body that the council’s chief executive collaborates with the chief executives of the council-controlled organisations to:
i) develop and implement a group assessment of risk by:
   A) developing a framework for combining the same or similar risks identified by each organisation into a cumulative group risk
   B) determining the most effective way to treat cumulative risk – either as a group or as individual organisations – and whether a portion of the risk should be insured
   C) reporting the cumulative group risk to the Audit and Risk Committee on a quarterly basis

ii) build a business case to improve legal operational efficiency
   A) determining and understanding the current gaps impacting efficiency
   B) identifying and evaluating a range of options (largely technology) which will close the identified gaps and complete the approved business case

iii) adopt a more strategic approach to insurance
   A) understanding the risks the group faces and the strength of the group balance sheet to manage that risk
   B) assessing current insurance cover against our risk profile to:
      1) purchase insurance only when events have potential to materially and adversely impact council’s credit rating
      2) insure key assets that materially affect service delivery and the group balance sheet
      3) apply meaningful deductibles consistent with balance sheet capacity ($52 billion in assets) and risk appetite.

CARRIED

9 Value for Money Programme quarterly update
Resolution number APP/2019/64
MOVED by Cr D Simpson, seconded by Mayor P Goff:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
a) note the Value for Money Programme status and 2019 work programme
b) receive the progress updates for the Value for Money reviews on:
   i) domestic waste services
   ii) investment attraction and global partnerships
   iii) group procurement
   iv) information, communications and technology
   v) customer services.

CARRIED
10 Value for Money programme – end of council term status and review

Resolution number APP/2019/65

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note the end of council term status and review report
b) agree that a Value for Money programme briefing paper be prepared by the group chief financial officer for the incoming council.

CARRIED

11 Auckland Council progress on savings up to 30 June 2019

A PowerPoint presentation was given. A copy has been placed on the official minutes and is available on the Auckland Council website as a minutes attachment.

Cr P Hulse left the meeting at 11.26am.
Cr R Hills left the meeting at 11.42am.

Resolution number APP/2019/66

MOVED by Cr D Simpson, seconded by Mayor P Goff:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note the Auckland Council progress report on savings up to 30 June 2019.
b) request staff to send the report and presentation to all councillors and local board members for their information.

CARRIED

Attachments

A 5 September 2019, Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee, Item 11 - Auckland Council progress on savings up to 30 June 2019 - PowerPoint presentation

12 Process for appointment of board members to the Community Education Trust Auckland - COMET

Resolution number APP/2019/67

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) note that there is a confidential report on this meeting agenda with recommendations regarding the appointment of trustees to the board of Community Education Trust Auckland.
b) note this report is confidential due to the personal information due to the personal information contained in it and the final appointment decisions will be made publicly available at the conclusion of the appointment process.

CARRIED
13 Process for the appointment of directors and board members to the Auckland’s council-controlled organisations, the Auckland War Memorial Museum, and the Museum of Transport and Technology
Resolution number APP/2019/68
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
   a) note there is a confidential report on this meeting agenda providing recommendations regarding the appointment and/or reappointment of directors to the Auckland War Memorial Museum and the Museum of Transport and Technology boards
   b) note that Regional Facilities Auckland supports the board appointment process for Auckland War Memorial Museum and the Museum of Transport and Technology boards by running a board member selection process and making recommendations to Auckland Council
   c) note there is a confidential report on this meeting agenda requesting the committee make decisions regarding the appointment of directors to Auckland Transport and Regional Facilities Auckland
   d) note that these reports are confidential due to the personal information contained in them and the final appointment decisions will be made publicly available at the conclusion of the appointment process.

CARRIED

Note: The chairperson accorded precedence to Item 16 – Process for reappointment of board members to the Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust.

16 Process for reappointment of board members to the Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust
Resolution number APP/2019/69
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Chairperson C Fletcher:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
   a) note that there is a confidential report on this meeting agenda with recommendations regarding the appointment of trustees to the board of Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust.
   b) note this report is confidential due to the personal information contained in it and the final appointment decisions will be made publicly available at the conclusion of the appointment process.

CARRIED

14 Consideration of Extraordinary Items
There was no consideration of extraordinary items.

Note: Item 16 – Process for reappointment of board members to the Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust was considered prior to item 14 – Consideration of Extraordinary Items.
15 Procedural motion to exclude the public

Resolution number APP/2019/70

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore:

That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

a) exclude the public from the following part(s) of the proceedings of this meeting.

b) agree that Peter Kerridge, Partner – Kerridge and Partners and Jane Atherton, Consultant – Kerridge and Partners be permitted to remain for Confidential Items C3 – CONFIDENTIAL – Board appointments to council-controlled organisations; C4 - CONFIDENTIAL – Shortlisting candidates for Auckland Transport director vacancy; and C5 – CONFIDENTIAL – Board appointments to Auckland Transport after the public has been excluded, because of their knowledge of matters which will help the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee in its decision-making.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution follows.

This resolution is made in reliance on section 48(1)(a) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 and the particular interest or interests protected by section 6 or section 7 of that Act which would be prejudiced by the holding of the whole or relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting in public, as follows:

C1 CONFIDENTIAL: Appointment of board members to the Community Education Trust Auckland - COMET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains information on individuals' qualifications for appointment.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C2 CONFIDENTIAL Board appointments to Auckland War Memorial Museum and Museum of Transport and Technology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about the candidates who have applied and been appointed to Auckland War Memorial Museum and Museum of Transport and Technology.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### C3 CONFIDENTIAL Board appointments to Auckland’s council-controlled organisations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about the directors on Regional Facilities Auckland.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C4 CONFIDENTIAL Shortlisting candidates for Auckland Transport director vacancy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about candidates being shortlisted for a director vacancy on Auckland Transport’s board.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C5 CONFIDENTIAL Board appointments to Auckland Transport

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about candidates who have applied for chair vacancy on Auckland Transport’s board.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### C6 CONFIDENTIAL: Board appointments: Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust (MBCT)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</th>
<th>Particular interest(s) protected (where applicable)</th>
<th>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
<td>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of a deceased person. In particular, the report contains private information about the candidates for the positions of trustee in the Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust.</td>
<td>s48(1)(a) The public conduct of the part of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding exists under section 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The text of these resolutions is made available to the public who are present at the meeting and form part of the minutes of the meeting.

CARRIED

11.48am The public was excluded.

Resolutions in relation to the confidential items are recorded in the confidential section of these minutes and are not publicly available.

1.10pm The public was re-admitted.

RESTATEMENTS

It was resolved while the public was excluded:

C1 CONFIDENTIAL: Appointment of board members to the Community Education Trust Auckland - COMET

Resolution number APP/2019/71

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

c) agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report

d) note that at the conclusion of the appointment process the decisions will be made publicly available.

C2 CONFIDENTIAL Board appointments to Auckland War Memorial Museum and Museum of Transport and Technology

Resolution number APP/2019/73

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

f) request that resolutions a) to e) be made public once the appointees and unsuccessful candidates have been notified, noting that the agenda report and attachments are to remain confidential.

C3 CONFIDENTIAL Board appointments to Auckland’s council-controlled organisations

Resolution number APP/2019/74

MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:

c) agree that the report and attachments will always remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report

d) note that at the conclusion of the appointment process the decisions will be made publicly available.
C4 CONFIDENTIAL Shortlisting candidates for Auckland Transport director vacancy
Resolution number APP/2019/75
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr C Darby:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
c) agree that the report and attachments will always remain confidential due to the private information relating to individuals contained in the report
d) note that at the conclusion of the appointment process the decisions will be made publicly available.

C5 CONFIDENTIAL: Board appointments to Auckland Transport
Resolution number APP/2019/76
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Cr D Simpson:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
b) agree that no restatement be made at this time.

C6 CONFIDENTIAL: Board appointments: Manukau Beautification Charitable Trust (MBCT)
Resolution number APP/2019/72
MOVED by Mayor P Goff, seconded by Deputy Mayor BC Cashmore:
That the Appointments, Performance Review and Value for Money Committee:
b) agree that the report and attachments will remain confidential, but clause a) can be made publicly available once candidates have been notified.

1.10pm The Chairperson thanked Members for their attendance and attention to business and declared the meeting closed.

CONFIRMED AS A TRUE AND CORRECT RECORD AT A MEETING OF THE APPOINTMENTS, PERFORMANCE REVIEW AND VALUE FOR MONEY COMMITTEE HELD ON

DATE:..............................................................

CHAIRPERSON:..................................................